



<b>Project:</b>	<b>Silverton Wind Farm</b>
<b>Meeting No:</b>	10
<b>Date:</b>	Thursday 24 October 2013
<b>Venue and Time:</b>	Silverton Youth Hall 6pm – 8pm
<b>Document:</b>	Meeting notes and actions
<b>Chair/Facilitator:</b>	Kath Elliott (KE)
<b>Minutes:</b>	Rosa Han (RH), AGL
<b>AGL representatives:</b>	Neil Cooke (NC) Manager, Power Development Helena Orel (HO) Manager, Community Engagement Scott Thomas (ST) General Manager Business Customers & Power Development Nicole Rizgalla (NR) Acting Media Manager
<b>Committee Members:</b>	Cynthia Langford, Purnamoota Station
	Kevin White, Historic Daydream Mine
	Phillip Blore, Belmont Station
	John Taplin, Secretary Silverton Village Committee
	Tiff Brown, Department of Primary Industries, Catchments & Lands
	Albert Woodroffe, Silverton Committee, Horizon Galleries
	Naomi Schmidt, Eldee Station
	Marion Browne, Councillor Broken Hill City Council
	Peter Price, Silverton Committee/ Silverton Hotel
<b>Apologies</b>	Maureen O'Donnell, Traditional Owner
	Joanne O'Donnell, Broken Hill Land Council
	Rod Grenfell, Local resident
	Cameron Koch, Silver City Minerals
	Helen Murray, Local resident
	Anne Bransdon, Chamber of Commerce
	Steve Radford, Consolidated Mining and Civil
<b>Community observers in attendance:</b>	Approximately 10

## Meeting Minutes

Item	Action
<p><b>1. Welcome</b></p> <p>Kath Elliott (KE) opened the meeting at 6:00pm and welcomed members of the Silverton Community Consultative Committee (SCCC) and observers in attendance.</p> <p>KE introduced the following AGL representatives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scott Thomas (ST), General Manager Business Customers &amp; Power Development</li> <li>• Nicole Rizgalla (NR), Media Manager</li> </ul> <p>KE provided an overview of the agenda and noted that the updated Terms of Reference (TOR) will be moved to Item 5. The minutes from the July 2013 meeting were discussed and adopted by the committee with no changes required.</p> <p>KE discussed the issue of having the media present at the CCC meetings. She noted that some members had expressed their concern of recent media reports.</p> <p>Members raised the following issues:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Comments/quotes taken out of context in the articles</li> <li>• Members not being able to speak openly about issues with the media present</li> <li>• Comments made about residents that negatively portrayed them</li> <li>• A suggestion for media to not be present at all meetings</li> </ul> <p>A member commented that he was previously not able to watch the health presentation as the CD provided was not working and this was unfairly portrayed in the media.</p> <p>Neil Cooke (NC) commented on the topic of media at meetings. He noted that it is AGL's policy and practice to be open and transparent and the meetings are open to the public as stated in the TOR, which includes the media.</p> <p>Nicole Rizgalla (NR) noted that the media reports have generally been balanced and AGL wants to be authentic and transparent. She commented that it would be seen as censorship not to include media in all meetings and that it was fair to give them the right to report on meetings. She also advised members that they had the right to ask the reporter to fact check if they were being quoted.</p>	

<p>It was agreed that KE would write to the media on behalf of the CCC and ask them to fact check before publishing articles. It was also agreed that KE would speak to the media on behalf of the members before CCC meetings on the protocols of interviewing and quoting members in articles.</p>	<p>KE to write to the media on behalf of CCC.</p>
<p><b>2. Project status update, Neil Cooke</b></p> <p>NC noted that the modification request is currently on public exhibition and will be available until 1 November 2013. This is for the request for project extension until 24th May 2016 which covers the following four points as requested by Department of Planning and Infrastructure:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Justification for the project</li> <li>2. Community issues/ implications associated with the delay to the project.</li> <li>3. Environmental changes that may have occurred as a result of increased rainfall in recent years.</li> <li>4. Changes in environmental regulations between 2009 and now</li> </ol> <p>He also noted that the following environmental reports are being progressed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2 rock quarries</li> <li>• 1 sand quarry</li> <li>• Bypass Rd</li> </ul> <p>It is expected that all four reports will be ready in November 2013 and it will go to the determining authority for approval. This will be either Crown Lands or Broken Hill Council or, for the Bypass road, to both.</p> <p>NC noted that the Construction Environment Management Plan (CEMP) is being prepared by Aurecon (the owner's engineers for the project) and this includes the Traffic Management Plan (TMP). A draft TMP is being prepared and NC proposed for a workshop session to be held in early December with key stakeholders including interested CCC members. The workshop will be open to the public and the following stakeholders will be in attendance: RMS, Aurecon, AGL and Broken Hill Council.</p> <p>The following CCC members nominated themselves to be part of the workshop:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Kevin White</li> <li>• Peter Price</li> <li>• John Taplin</li> </ul> <p>NC asked the CCC to contact him if any other members were interested in participating.</p>	

<p>Questions:</p> <p>Q1. Where will the TMP workshop be held?</p> <p>A1. At the Silverton Youth Hall.</p> <p>Q2. It was said earlier that the TMP would be prepared when a tenderer had been selected. Why is this happening now?</p> <p>A2. Due to the deferment of the appointment of the EPC contractor, certain aspects of the project have shifted.</p>	
<p><b>3. Silverton Community Survey, Helena Orel</b></p> <p>Helena Orel (HO) presented the results from the recent Deferment Survey that was distributed to CCC members and Silverton residents.</p> <p><i>See presentation slides 4 to 5.</i></p> <p>She noted that the findings that were submitting to DPI included verbatim comments from the responses.</p> <p>Comments:</p> <p>Kevin White (KW) commented that in the past 12 months, he has spoken to many tourists who visit the Daydream Mine about the proposed wind farm. He noted that many of them prefer them to be in a location that is not visible on the hills. He also commented that he believes that if the wind farm is built, it will have a significant impact on tourism.</p>	
<p><b>4. Discussion about health and wind farms</b></p> <p>KE asked the CCC if they would like Simon Chapman's presentation to be played at the meeting for all members and observers to watch together.</p> <p>The CCC said they did not want this to be played.</p> <p>John Taplin (JT) tabled 3 documents to the CCC:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Australian Industrial Wind Turbine Awareness Network – Wind Turbines impact land values</li> <li>2. "<i>Schultz slams Simon Chapman and mauls Michael Moore in the Big House on the Hill</i>"- news article</li> <li>3. Letter from Alec N. Salt, Washington University in St. Louis</li> </ol> <p>Comments on Simon Chapman's presentation on health and wind farms:</p> <p>JT commented that he doesn't think Chapman is a credible source and thought that the CCC had no say in who they wanted to hear from. He said his preference was to hear a presentation from Sarah Laurie and he did not want to hear from an expert arranged by AGL.</p>	

KW commented that he thought it was one sided and would like to get the other side of the story. He also commented that the town had already been impacted by the mining companies in the past.

An observer commented that Chapman states at the start of the presentation that he does not have medical credentials and his research paper on the topic was conducted with the assistance of a team that had the relevant qualifications.

KE noted that Chapman was not paid any money by AGL and he did not want to be flown to the meeting venue which is why the presentation was done online and in his own time. She also noted that it was the Coopers Gap CCC that had requested him to present.

Scott Thomas (ST) commented that AGL has been in business for 176 years and a lot of effort has been made in order to understand if there is a link between health and wind farms. He noted that AGL is not aware of any scientific evidence that confirms that wind farms cause health effects.

ST stated that in the unlikely event anything did happen to cause concern, AGL will take immediate action to ensure the problem is fixed. For example, an issue was identified at the Oaklands Hill Wind Farm in Victoria and the appropriate measures were immediately taken to ensure that the issue was managed and resolved.

Albert Woodroffe (AW) made general comments about how AGL produces gas and how an individual could use this to cause harm on themselves.

Naomi Schmidt (NS) commented that she found the presentation to be subjective, not well balanced and not enough evidence provided to support his position.

KE summarised the views of some concerned CCC members:

- Concern that the CCC are not able to have any control over AGL's project.
- Concern about possible health effects.
- Chapman's presentation is one sided and general consensus is that it was imposed on the CCC rather than the committee being able to decide on a suitable presenter.
- Need to hear from other experts

Next steps:

- AGL to provide links to Government and other research sources for members to access and CCC to also do their own research.
- CCC members to think about experts that have peer reviewed papers and who are eminent in their field that they would like to hear from and bring a list of those experts back to the CCC to discuss.

It was also suggested by a CCC member that if the CCC were not comfortable inviting Sarah Laurie to a meeting then some members could meet with her independent of the CCC.

KE clarified that there is nothing stopping CCC members from speaking to anybody about wind farms and part of their role as CCC members was to get information and to also assess the information to ensure it is credible.

ST suggested that CCC members could also talk to people who lived near a wind farm and seek their views.

A member noted that there seemed to be two sides to the health debate in wind farm communities as those who have turbines on their property say they aren't affected and those who don't have turbines say they are.

Questions:

Q1. Why was the Q&A session cut from the presentation?

A1. KE answered that she was the facilitator for that meeting and the CCC members did not want to be filmed as the presentation was going to be made available to the public on the website. She also noted that the Q&A session had been minuted and this was sent out to Silverton CCC members along with the October meeting agenda.

*Note: The minutes which contains the Q&A is available on the website: [agl.com.au/coopersgap](http://agl.com.au/coopersgap)*

In relation to the topic of property values, KE noted that Bob Dupont, a property valuer, gave a presentation to the Coopers Gap CCC and he could be invited to present to the Silverton CCC if the members were comfortable.

Q1. When will the next CCC meeting be held and when will Bob Dupont be able to present to us?

A1. The TMP workshop is proposed for the first week of December. If the CCC agree, the next meeting can be held afterwards.

The CCC agreed to hold the next meeting after the TMP workshop.

AGL to send out details of Bob Dupont with minutes.

## 5. Other business

KE discussed the membership criteria in the TOR for the committee. She sought feedback from the CCC in regard to the updated criteria:

*Members should commit to attend all SCCC meetings and if unable to attend provide appropriate notice where possible.*

*The requirement for membership is a 75% attendance in any calendar year.*

KE noted that there will be some flexibility around this clause such as the weather on the day.

The CCC agreed to the updated clause.

A comment was made from a member that she has noticed that for other AGL CCC meetings, the meetings were held in different locations and this should be considered for the Silverton CCC meetings.

KE clarified that for that particular CCC, it was the members who had requested for the meetings to be held in different locations. KE noted that the Silverton CCC meetings can be held in other locations if agreed by the CCC.

KE called a vote from the CCC on this matter. The majority of members agreed to continue holding the meetings in Silverton.

NC noted that he was open to the idea of changing the time of the meetings.

It was agreed that at each meeting the CCC would decide what time they would like to meet at the next meeting.

The CCC agreed that the next meeting will commence at 2pm and finish at 4pm.

It was also noted that there is the option for members to resign from the committee and for other members of the community to participate.

KE reminded the CCC that as part of their role as a member, they must be willing to disseminate information received during the CCC meetings back to the community and also gather input from the community and bring forward any queries raised.

HO provided a brief update on the Solar Plant that AGL will be constructing in Broken Hill and Nyngan in 2014.



**6. Next meeting and close**

The next meeting will be held on Thursday, 5 December from 2pm to 4pm at the Silverton Youth Hall.

*Post meeting clarification:*

*The TMP workshop will be held on Thursday, 5 December from 9am to 12pm. This meeting is open to the public.*

KE closed the meeting at 7.35pm



Action Item	CCC meeting	Status
KE to write to the media on behalf of the CCC and ask them to fact check before publishing articles.	October 2013	
KE to speak to the media on behalf of the members before CCC meetings on the protocols of interviewing and quoting members in articles.	October 2013	Ongoing
AGL to provide links to Government and other research sources and CCC to also do their own research.	October 2013	
CCC members to think about experts that have peer reviewed papers and who are eminent in their field that they would like to hear from and bring a list of those experts back to the CCC to discuss.	October 2013	
AGL to send out details of Bob Dupont with minutes.	October 2013	Closed
AGL to update TOR with new clause.	October 2013	